# BEFORE THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF THE MT. DIABLO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT COUNTY OF CONTRA COSTA STATE OF CALIFORNIA

# RESOLUTION APPROVING PROPOSED DECISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE AND IMPLEMENTING CERTIFICATED LAYOFF

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 09/10 - 60**

WHEREAS, on March 9, 2010, this Board of Education of Mt. Diablo Unified School District adopted Resolution No. 09/10-45 to reduce and discontinue particular kinds of certificated services not later than the beginning of the 2010-2011 school year; and

WHEREAS, by letter dated March 12, 2010, the Superintendent and/or his designee served notice to this Board of Education that certain certificated employees listed therein receive notice that their services will not be required for the ensuing 2010-2011 school year, pursuant to Education Code sections 44949 and 44955; and

WHEREAS, by notice dated March 12, 2010, the Superintendent and/or his designee served notices to those certificated employees, including those listed in Attachment A of the Proposed Decision and others, that their services will not be required for the 2010-2011 school year, pursuant to Education Code sections 44949 and 44955; and

WHEREAS, each of those certificated employees was advised that he or she could request a hearing before the Board of Education to determine if there was cause for not reemploying them for the 2010-2011 school year and that failure to request a hearing within the time specified shall constitute a waiver of their right to a hearing and he or she shall accordingly be terminated in accordance with Resolution No. 09/10-45; and

WHEREAS, certain certificated employees did not request a hearing and, therefore, waived their right to a hearing; and

WHEREAS, certain certificated employees requested a hearing and layoff proceedings were held in accordance with sections 44955 and 44949 of the Education Code before an Administrative Law Judge who conducted an evidentiary hearing and submitted a Proposed Decision relating to those proceedings, which decision is attached hereto; and

WHEREAS, the District rescinded a number of layoff notices prior to the commencement of the layoff hearing which occurred on April 27, 2010; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to sections 44955 and 44949 of the Education Code, this Board has received and considered the findings set forth in the Proposed Decision issued on April 29, 2010 by the Honorable Nancy Rasmussen, Administrative Law Judge in the matter of the Teacher Layoff Hearing of Mt. Diablo School District, OAH No. 2010030157; and

WHEREAS, the Proposed Decision contains Judge Rasmussen's determination that sufficient cause exists for the elimination of the remaining 152.30 Full Time Equivalent certificated positions whose layoffs were not rescinded and recommends that notice be given to the employees holding those positions that their services will not be required for the 2010-2011 school year; and

WHEREAS, the particular kinds of services to be discontinued and reduced as referenced in Resolution No. 09/10-45 are each determined to be a particular kind of service within the meaning of Education Code section 44955; and

WHEREAS, with the exception of courses requiring Bilingual Cross-Cultural Language and Development (BCLAD) certificates, the services of no certificated employee are being terminated, in whole or in part, while any probationary or other employee with less seniority is retained to render a service which said certificated employee is certificated and competent to render; the individuals whose employment is being terminated, in whole or in part, are not certificated and competent (within the meaning of Education Code section 44955) to render a service being performed by any employee with less seniority who is being retained; and

WHEREAS, sufficient cause exists for the termination of up to 152.30 Full Time Equivalent certificated positions, and pursuant to and within the meaning of Education Code section 44949, said cause relates to the welfare of the schools and the pupils thereof; and

WHEREAS, rights to reemployment are at times provided to certificated employees whose services were terminated as a result of layoff, however, this current Resolution does not supercede any prior resolution by this Board nor reinstates any right to further employment or reemployment, so that any employee previously notified of non-reelection or non-renewal for the following school year possesses no right to reemployment as a result of adoption of this current Resolution.

WHEREAS, Section 44949 of the Education Code requires the Governing Board to make the final determination as to the sufficiency of the cause and disposition; and

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that the Board of Education hereby accepts the Proposed Decision of the Administrative Law Judge and adopts that Proposed Decision as the decision of this Board of Education.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that as a result of the adoption or modification of the Proposed Decision, a maximum of 152.30 Full Time Equivalent positions shall be eliminated.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that the employment of each of the certificated employees listed in Attachment A of the Proposed Decision as well as those who waived their right to hearing is hereby terminated effective June 30, 2010.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that this decision is effective immediately and that the Superintendent or his designee(s) is directed and authorized to give appropriate notice, on or before May 14, 2010 in the manner prescribed in Education Code section 44949, to those employees whose positions will be lost by virtue of this action that their services are terminated, and to take such other actions as are necessary and appropriate to implement this Resolution.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that reemployment rights be afforded in accordance with the Education Code, if and when reemployment is offered and to the extent any reemployment rights are applicable to any of the above-referenced employees, unless this Board has previously determined to not reelect that employee.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that the adoption of the Proposed Decision shall not be considered procedural in the nature or the promulgation of Board of Education policy. Moreover, any and all principles set forth in the decision shall be strictly limited to the current layoffs and to the individuals in the named decision and shall not be interpreted to apply globally to all District employees outside of the current layoff context.

**PASSED AND ADOPTED** by the following vote of the Board of Education of the Mt. Diablo Unified School District of Contra Costa County, State of California, this 11th day of May 2010.

AYES: NOES ABSTENTIONS: ABSENT:	
BY:	Paul Strange President of the Board of Education of the
Attested to:	Mt. Diablo Unified School District
Steven Lawrence, Ph.D. Secretary of the Board of Education of Mt. Diablo Unified School District	

Attachment: Proposed (Adopted) Decision of the Administrative Law Judge

# BEFORE THE BOARD OF EDUCATION MOUNT DIABLO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

In the Matter of the Proposed Layoff of:	
Certificated Employees,	

Respondents.

OAH No. 2010030157

#### PROPOSED DECISION

Administrative Law Judge Nancy L. Rasmussen, Office of Administrative Hearings, State of California, heard this matter on April 27, 2010, in Concord, California.

Deborah Cooksey, Associate General Counsel, and Joshua A. Stevens, of Fagen Friedman & Fulfrost LLP, represented the Mount Diablo Unified School District.

Ernest M. Tuttle III, of Tuttle & McCloskey, represented all respondents except for Jessica Hjort.

There was no appearance by or on behalf of respondent Jessica Hjort.

The matter was submitted for decision on April 27, 2010. On April 28, 2010, the record was reopened upon receipt from the district of an updated list of respondents. That list was marked as Exhibit 9 and admitted in evidence. (Mr. Tuttle stipulated to admission of the list.) On April 28, 2010, the record was closed and the matter deemed submitted for decision.

#### FACTUAL FINDINGS

- 1. Dr. Steven Lawrence made and filed the accusation in his official capacity as Superintendent of the Mount Diablo Unified School District.
- 2. Respondents are listed on Appendix A, attached hereto and by this reference incorporated herein. Each respondent is a certificated employee of the district.
- 3. On March 9, 2010, the Board of Education adopted Resolution No. 09/10-45, reducing or discontinuing particular kinds of services for the 2010-2011 school year and directing the Superintendent or his designee to give appropriate notices to certificated employees whose positions will be affected by the action.

- 4. On or before March 15, 2010, Superintendent Lawrence gave written notice to respondents and other certificated employees of the recommendation that their services will not be required for the 2010-2011 school year. The reasons for the recommendation were set forth in these preliminary layoff notices.
- 5. Respondents and other certificated employees filed timely requests for hearing to determine if there is cause for terminating their services for the 2009-2010 school year. An accusation was served on respondents and others, and all respondents are deemed to have filed timely notices of defense. All prehearing jurisdictional requirements have been met.
- 6. On March 9, 2010, in order to address a projected budget deficit, the board took action to reduce or discontinue the following particular kinds of services for the 2010-2011 school year:

District Wide	
Special Education Administrator, DIS	1.00 FTE <sup>1</sup>
Student Services Coordinators	3.00 FTE
DIS Teacher	1.00 FTE
Special Day Class Teacher	1.00 FTE
School Psychologists	2.00 FTE
Resource Specialists	24.50 FTE
Instrumental Music – 5 <sup>th</sup> grade	7.33 FTE
Vocal Music – Elementary	15.00 FTE
Library Media Teachers	23.00 FTE
Adult Education Teacher	10.00 FTE
Elementary Teaching Positions	
K-5 Classroom Teachers	34.00 FTE
Reading/Language Arts/Math Intervention	6.53 FTE
Teacher	
Middle School Teaching Positions	
Core	10.34 FTE
Science	1.85 FTE
Spanish	.68 FTE
AIMS	1.17 FTE
Mathematics	1.74 FTE
English	2.28 FTE
Reading	.37 FTE
PE	1.77 FTE
History	1.74 FTE
Academic Literacy	.56 FTE
Hands on Technology (HOT)	.14 FTE

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Full-time equivalent positions.

French	.14 FTE
Woodshop	.14 FTE
Academic Success	1.34 FTE
Chorus/Music	.37 FTE
Band	.37 FTE
Banu	.5/ 1112
High School Teaching Positions	
Commercial Art (ROP)	.20 FTE
Advanced Photography (ROP)	.80 FTE
Computerized Accounting and Computer	.60 FTE
Applications (ROP)	
Biotechnology (ROP)	1.00 FTE
Robotics (ROP)	.40 FTE
Advanced Automotive Technology (ROP)	.60 FTE
Commercial Baking (ROP)	.40 FTE
Restaurant Occupations (ROP)	.40 FTE
AP Environmental Science (ROP)	.20 FTE
Construction Technology (ROP)	.20 FTE
Computer Programming (ROP)	.20 FTE
Journalism Productions (ROP)	.40 FTE
Careers in Teaching and Careers in Teaching	.60 FTE
Internships (ROP)	
Photography and Art and Animation (ROP)	.40 FTE
Sports Medicine (ROP)	.80 FTE
Creative Writing (ROP)	.20 FTE
Radio Station Broadcasting (ROP)	.40 FTE
Computer Graphics and Web Page Design	.40 FTE
(ROP)	
Analytical Forensic Science (ROP)	.20 FTE
Sports Medicine and Advanced Sports Medicine	.40 FTE
(ROP)	
Developmental Psychology of Children (ROP)	.20 FTE
Intro to Law (ROP)	.40 FTE
Art of Video Productions and Computer Art and	.40 FTE
Animation (ROP)	
Mathematics	2.60 FTE
English	3.60 FTE
Spanish	2.80 FTE
History	2.80 FTE
Sociology	1.20 FTE
Earth Science	1.40 FTE
Chemistry	1.70 FTE
Biology	2.10 FTE
Physics	1.80 FTE
AIMS	.60 FTE

PE	1.40 FTE
Weights	.20 FTE
Work Experience (WEE)	.20 FTE
Foods	.20 FTE
Art	1.40 FTE
Photography	.40 FTE
German	.20 FTE
Zoology	.80 FTE
Ceramics	.80 FTE
Drama	.60 FTE
Auto Shop	.20 FTE
Psychology	1.60 FTE
Science	.80 FTE
Computers	1.20 FTE
Economics	1.80 FTE
Government	1.20 FTE
Athletic Director	.20 FTE
WASC	.20 FTE
Intervention Teacher	.20 FTE
Multiple Subjects (Horizons CIS)	3.00 FTE
Total:	199.36 FTE

- 7. Before issuing the preliminary layoff notices, the district took into account all positively assured attrition. Additional attrition which became known before the hearing enabled the district to rescind many of the notices. As of the time of the hearing, the district was planning to lay off 171 certificated employees in 152.30 full-time equivalent positions. The district must issue the final layoff notices before May 15, and when it does so the district will take into account any additional attrition that has occurred.
- 8. Pursuant to the board's resolution, the district intends to retain regardless of seniority (i.e., "skip" in the layoff process) certificated employees who possess a BCLAD certificate and bilingual school psychologists. All employees with a BCLAD certificate will be assigned next year to positions requiring such certification.
- 9. Under Education Code section 44955, subdivision (b), "the services of no permanent employee may be terminated under the provisions of this section while any probationary employee, or any other employee with less seniority, is retained to render a service which said permanent employee is certificated and competent to render." (Italics added.) To comply with this provision in determining which employees will be laid off in a particular subject area, the district has given preference to permanent employees over probationary employees, even when a probationary employee has an earlier seniority date than a permanent employee. Except in this unusual circumstance, no certificated employee

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Bilingual, Cross-Cultural, Language and Academic Development.

junior in seniority to any respondent is being retained by the district to perform services that any respondent is certificated and competent to render.

### LEGAL CONCLUSIONS

- 1. Jurisdiction for this proceeding exists pursuant to Education Code sections 44949 and 44955.
- 2. Cause exists because of the reduction or elimination of particular kinds of services pursuant to Education Code section 44955 to give notice to respondents that their services will not be required for the 2010-2011 school year. The cause relates solely to the welfare of the schools and the pupils thereof within the meaning of Education Code section 44949.

#### **ORDER**

Notice may be given to respondents that their services will not be required for the 2010-2011 school year because of the reduction or elimination of particular kinds of services.

DATED: <u>April 29, 2010</u>

NANCY L. KASMUSSEN Administrative Law Judge

Office of Administrative Hearings

## Appendix A - Respondents

Abdullah, Bashar Abella, Rachel Aguilera, Claudia Alcaide Tubio, Francisco

Almond, Josh
Alumbaugh, Arlan
Amodio, Kathleen
Anderson, Kimberly
Andrade, Jacqueline

Andrews, Emily Archangelo, Karen

Ayon, Gina Ayres, Sherry Azevedo, Katherine Ballard, Benjamin Barabak, Marianne Barambani, Stephanie

Batson, Jennifer Bautista, Jan Beerbaum, Jessica Benbrook, Ross Berry, Meghan Blubaugh, Erin Bond, Alyssa

Breashears, Barbara Bromley, Josephine Brooks, Ryann Brown, Gregory

Brown, Stella Bullard, Deborah Calderon, Marie

Campopiano, Benjamin

Carney, Bridget Chevial, Matthew Coartney, Gary Cook, Julie Crandell, Kathryn Crisp, Jennifer

DeAngelis, Jennifer Delaney, Jamie

DeMaggio, Sarah Dewes, Nicole Diamond, Eric Didion, Deirdre Diestler, Jenna Dillon, Paula

Dolley, Corey Doster, Dennis

Edwards, John Emigh, Christian

Evans, Robin Evans, Sandra Ferris, Danielle

Fierros, Carlota

Filipinia, Maria Teresita

Fisher, Adam Gamblin, Lori Ann Gamez, Sarah Garcia, Vanessa Gilford, Spencer Graham, Emily Greenblatt, Laura

Grewe, Kimberly Gundelfinger, Paul Hatch, Suzanne Hatcher, Rose Mary

Herald, Nicholas Hernandez, Simone

Hile, Gregory Hjort, Jessica Hoelle, Allison Hood, Denise Hood, James

Husen Collins, Kathy

Iglesias, Ninfa
Jaquez, Magic
Johnson, Janelle
Johnson, Ollie
Kahrer, Martha
Kamal, Raj
Kaput, Susan

Kaur, Ramanpreet Kellersberger, Nicole

Kelly, Matt

Kennedy, Jane Klaas, Karin

Koontz, Kathleen

Krause, Emily Kriel, Travis

Liebow, Cheri Louie, Mamie

Lowande, Karen Lowell, Justin

Luebke, Christopher Luthra, Vandana

Marek, Andrea Mares, Michael Martin, Juan

Martini, Nancy McCollum, Bryan

McCurdy, Briannon Medina, Amanda Mikuni, Ronald

Miller, Robert
Mills, Virginia
Mimbs, Kristin

Minglana, Ernesto Montgomery, Ruth

Moore, Carolyn Moore, Sherrie

Moseley, Brendan Moseley, Jane

Moser, Michael Moses, Jonathan

Murphy, Megan Nassrallah, Zoila

Nesbeth, Keya Nichols, Sandra Nnaji, Carolyn

Okimura, Shelley Opsahl, Cynthia Patton, Emilie

Perona, Linette Phan, Khoa

Piotrasch, Michael

Pratt, Erica

Prodoehl, Daniel

Ravin, Monica

Richards, Emily

Rogers, James

Roy, Bradley

Runge, Virginia

Sabatier Lacher, Celine

Sain, Timotny

Shaw, Bryan

Shumate, Ruth

Sierra, Jade

Sikorski, Janet

Sinquefield, Danielle

Smith, Susanne

Smythe, Amanda

Snyder, Linda

Solinger, Carol

Sparks, Thomas

Spink, Patricia

Stevens, Nancy

Stoyer, Nancy

Sugden, Carissa

Tafoya, Monique

Taylor, Tracy

Tessandori, Iris

Thomas, Marcus

Thompson, Eric

Torres, Barbara

Townsend, Danya

Trujillo, Erin

Tsuruda, Shannon

Valerio, Elizabeth

Villars, Nikolas

Walker, Achilles

Weaver, Lauren Welch, Jacqueline

Wharton, Michael

Wieland, Elizabeth

Willner, Stephen

Wilson, Elijah

Winterich, Anne

With, M. Lynn

Wright, David

Xiromamos, Pamela

